

**CROSS-SECTOR COLLABORATION IN REGION X
PHILIPPINES' DISASTER MANAGEMENT**

By

**Hazel D. Jovita
20152020010**

DISSERTATION

**Submitted to the Doctoral Program
Post-Graduate Studies Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta
In Partial Fulfilment of the requirements for the Degree of
Doctor of Political Science**



**POST-GRADUATE STUDIES PROGRAM
UNIVERSITAS MUHAMMADIYAH YOGYAKARTA
2018**

STATEMENT OF AUTHENTICITY

I, the undersigned hereby declare that:

1. This dissertation is my own original writing and has never been proposed to get an academic degree (bachelor, master and/or doctorate), either at University of Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta and other universities.
2. This paper is purely my own ideas, formulas, and research, without the help of others, except the direction of the Promoter Team and inputs of the Review Team / Team of Examiners.
3. In this paper, there are no works or opinions that have been written or published by other people, except in certain parts of the referenced sections where the source is listed as a reference in the text, with the name of the author included in the list of references.

I make this actual statement and if in future there are irregularities and untruths in this statement, then I am willing to accept academic sanctions in the form of revocation of academic titles obtained for this work, as well as other sanctions in accordance with the norms that apply in this University.

Yogyakarta, August 2018

Hazel D. Jovita

20152020010

DISSERTATION
CROSS-SECTOR COLLABORATION IN REGION X
PHILIPPINES' DISASTER MANAGEMENT

Submitted By

Hazel D. Jovita
20152020010

**This dissertation has been affirmed and ratified in front of the
Dissertation Examination Board
Doctoral Program in Political Science
Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta
13 August 2018**

Dissertation Examination Board

Prof. Dr. Tulus Warsito, MSi.
(Promotor/Examiner I)

Prof. Dr. Achmad Nurmandi, Msc.
(Co-Promotor/Examiner II)

Eko Priyo Purnomo, M.Res., Ph.D.
(Examiner III)

Prof. Dr. Sjafri Sairin, M.A.
(Examiner IV)

Dr. Ulung Pribadi, M.Si.
(Examiner V)

Knowing
Director, Post-Graduate Studies Program
Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta

Sri Atmaju P. Rosidi, ST., M.Sc.Eng., Ph.D., P.Eng.
NIK: 19780415200004123046

OFFICIAL MEMO

Dear:
Director, Post-Graduate Studies
Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta

Assalamu 'alaikum wr, wb.

Submitted with respect, after guidance, direction, and correction of the dissertation text entitled: Cross-Sector Collaboration in Region X Philippines' Disaster Management, written by:

Name: Hazel D. Jovita

NPM: 20152020010

Stage: S3

I am of the opinion that the dissertation may already be submitted to the Postgraduate Doctoral Program, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, for the Open Examination /Graduation.

Wassalamu 'alaikum wr, wb.

Yogyakarta,

Promotor/Examiner I

Prof. Dr. Tulus Warsito, MSi

OFFICIAL MEMO

Dear:
Director, Post-Graduate Studies
Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta

Assalamu 'alaikum wr, wb.

Submitted with respect, after guidance, direction, and correction of the dissertation text entitled: Cross-Sector Collaboration in Region X Philippines' Disaster Management, written by:

Name: Hazel D. Jovita

NPM: 20152020010

Stage: S3

I am of the opinion that the dissertation may already be submitted to the Postgraduate Doctoral Program, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, for the Open Examination /Graduation.

Wassalamu 'alaikum wr. wb.

Yogyakarta,

Co-Promotor/Examiner II

Prof. Dr. Achmad Nurmandi, Msc.

OFFICIAL MEMO

Dear:
Director, Post-Graduate Studies
Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta

Assalamu 'alaikum wr, wb.

Submitted with respect, after guidance, direction, and correction of the dissertation text entitled: Cross-Sector Collaboration in Region X Philippines' Disaster Management, written by:

Name: Hazel D. Jovita

NPM: 20152020010

Stage: S3

I am of the opinion that the dissertation may already be submitted to the Postgraduate Doctoral Program, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, for the Open Examination /Graduation.

Wassalamu 'alaikum wr, wb.

Yogyakarta,

Examiner III

Eko Priyo Purnomo, M.Res., Ph.D.

OFFICIAL MEMO

Dear:
Director, Post-Graduate Studies
Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta

Assalamu 'alaikum wr, wb.

Submitted with respect, after guidance, direction, and correction of the dissertation text entitled: Cross-Sector Collaboration in Region X Philippines' Disaster Management, written by:

Name: Hazel D. Jovita

NPM: 20152020010

Stage: S3

I am of the opinion that the dissertation may already be submitted to the Postgraduate Doctoral Program, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, for the Open Examination /Graduation.

Wassalamu 'alaikum wr, wb.

Yogyakarta,

Examiner IV

Prof. Dr. Sjafri Sairin, M.A.

OFFICIAL MEMO

Dear:
Director, Post-Graduate Studies
Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta

Assalamu 'alaikum wr, wb.

Submitted with respect, after guidance, direction, and correction of the dissertation text entitled: Cross-Sector Collaboration in Region X Philippines' Disaster Management, written by:

Name: Hazel D. Jovita

NPM: 20152020010

Stage: S3

I am of the opinion that the dissertation may already be submitted to the Postgraduate Doctoral Program, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, for the Open Examination /Graduation.

Wassalamu 'alaikum wr, wb.

Yogyakarta,

Examiner V

Dr. Ulung Pribadi, M.Si.

Abstract

The inherent complexity of disasters places government agencies and societies in vulnerable situations. This research uses cross-sector collaboration as the framework of analysis in looking into how the government manages typhoon-related emergencies. Primarily, the structure and governance processes of the disaster response network of the most susceptible areas in Region X, Philippines. This study uses the mixed-method approaches to Social Network Analysis and Structural Equation Modelling through Partial Least Squares were utilized in evaluating the network structure and governance processes of the Philippine disaster management and its implications for disaster governance. This research covers the data gathered from the 92 samples (44 respondents, 18 key informants and 30 typhoon survivors) from Region X, Province of Misamis Oriental, Cagayan de Oro and Iligan City. The findings revealed that the mandated tall-structure and the lead-organization form of network governance as stipulated in Republic Act 10121, does not work in the regional and local disaster management networks in Region X, particularly during Typhoon Washi in 2010. Moreover, the findings highlight the role of public managers and the significance of the previous performance of the network in the collaborative disaster management. Further, the findings revealed that the community remains to believe that their respective local officials are capable of helping them in times of need and are therefore can be trusted despite the shortcomings during the 2011 Typhoon Washi. With these, it is therefore concluded that the disaster management structure significantly affects the governance processes of the network. In order for the disaster management network to be effective, the structure of the DRRM network should evolve. Additionally, disaster leadership should be effective enough to provide captivating incentives, build interdependencies and strengthen trust among members through a sustained collaborative activity. The absence of a strong intergovernmental and inter-organizational relationships and disaster management champions, disaster response operations in the country will remain in limbo.

Keywords: collaboration, disaster management, governance, network analysis

Abstrak

Kompleksitas yang inheren dari bencana menempatkan lembaga pemerintah dan masyarakat dalam situasi yang rentan. Penelitian ini menggunakan kolaborasi lintas sektor sebagai kerangka analisis dalam melihat bagaimana pemerintah mengelola keadaan darurat terkait topan. Terutama, struktur dan proses tata kelola jaringan tanggap bencana dari daerah-daerah yang paling rawan di Wilayah X, Filipina. Penelitian ini menggunakan pendekatan metode campuran untuk Analisis Jaringan Sosial dan Pemodelan Persamaan Struktural melalui Partial Least Squares digunakan dalam mengevaluasi struktur jaringan dan proses tata kelola manajemen bencana Filipina dan implikasinya terhadap tata kelola bencana. Penelitian ini mencakup data yang dikumpulkan dari 92 sampel (44 responden, 18 informan kunci dan 30 korban topan) dari Wilayah X, Provinsi Misamis Oriental, Cagayan de Oro dan Iligan City. Temuan-temuan tersebut mengungkapkan bahwa struktur tinggi yang dimandatkan dan bentuk organisasi pemimpin dari tata kelola jaringan sebagaimana diatur dalam Undang-Undang Republik 10121, tidak bekerja dalam jaringan manajemen bencana regional dan lokal di Wilayah X, khususnya selama Topan Washi pada tahun 2010. Selain itu, Temuan menyoroti peran manajer publik dan pentingnya kinerja jaringan sebelumnya dalam manajemen bencana kolaboratif. Lebih lanjut, temuan ini mengungkapkan bahwa masyarakat tetap percaya bahwa pejabat lokal mereka masing-masing mampu membantu mereka pada saat dibutuhkan dan oleh karena itu dapat dipercaya meskipun ada kekurangan selama Topan Washi tahun 2011. Dengan ini, oleh karena itu disimpulkan bahwa struktur manajemen bencana secara signifikan mempengaruhi proses tata kelola jaringan. Agar jaringan manajemen bencana menjadi efektif, struktur jaringan DRRM harus berevolusi. Tata kelola bersama di jaringan tanggap bencana lokal harus dipertimbangkan untuk meningkatkan kompetensi lembaga lokal. Selain itu, kepemimpinan bencana harus cukup efektif untuk memberikan insentif yang menarik, membangun interdependensi dan memperkuat kepercayaan di antara anggota melalui aktivitas kolaboratif yang berkelanjutan. Ketiadaan hubungan antar pemerintah dan antar-organisasi dan juara manajemen bencana yang kuat, operasi tanggap bencana di negara ini akan tetap dalam keadaan limbo.

Preface

I used to think that nobody can do anything about disasters until December 16, 2011, when I have personally witnessed the massive impact of Typhoon Washi in the community where I am part of. It is when my great interest in studying the social and political aspects of disaster management started. This research provides a glimpse of how disasters are managed in Region X Philippines. The process of putting altogether relevant information to come up with an output worth-reading is gruelling but the guidance and overwhelming support of the following people made the burden bearable.

I am forever grateful to my academic supervisor and mentor, Prof. Dr. Achmad Nurmandi, for the countless opportunities he had given me to grow as a person and as a scholar for the past 3 years. I would like to thank my panel of examiners: Prof. Dr. Tulus Warsito, Dr. Eko Priyo Purnomo, Dr. Ulung Pribadi, and Prof. Dr. Sjafrin Sairin, for their valuable comments to further polish this research output. Also, I am thankful to Dr. Mega Hidayati, Dr. Hasse Juba, Ibu Menik, Mas Wasono and Mas Edu for the moral support they have extended during my stay at the University.

I would also like to thank the different government and non-government agencies in the Philippines Region X, Province of Misamis Oriental, and Cities of Cagayan de Oro and Iligan, as well as the typhoon survivors, who took part in this research.

Special thanks to Dr. Nelia Balgoa and her family, for the support and for welcoming me into their lovely home especially during the data gathering stage of this research.

Also, I am thankful to MSU-IIT and UMY Jusuf Kalla School of Government for the generous assistance towards the success of this academic endeavour. To Sir Iking, Yasmira, Queenie, and Chanda, my UMY life is more fun because you guys are in it. *Salamat.*

Heartfelt gratitude goes to my family to whom I dedicate this work: to Mama and Papa, thank you for the happy home and for always believing in me; to my sister and confidante, Holymae, for the solid emotional support, and to my fiancé, Paul, thank you for the love and patience.

Lastly, this work will not be accomplished without the grace from the Almighty God, who have carried me through the most difficult days of my life. Thank you, Father God.

This dissertation is a fulfilment of a dream and a product of hard work, passion, and faith in Divine power. May this work contribute to the efforts in building resilient communities in the Philippines.

Hazel D. Jovita
Yogyakarta, Indonesia

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER I - INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background of the Study	1
1.2 Research Problem	7
1.3 Objectives	8
1.4 Purpose of Research	8
1.5 Limitations of the research Structure of the Dissertation	9
1.6 Structure of the Dissertation	9
1.7 List of published scientific works	12

CHAPTER II - REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE, THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK, AND HYPOTHESES

2.1 The Philippine disaster response during typhoons	13
2.2 Collaborative governance	18
2.2.1 How does collaboration work?	23
2.2.2 Collaborative Outcome and Accountabilities	28
2.3 Theoretical Framework	38
2.4 Research Hypotheses	43

CHAPTER III - RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1 Research Design	45
3.2 Research Setting	46
3.3 Population and Sampling	47
3.4 Data collection	49
3.5 Data Analysis Techniques	52

CHAPTER IV – GOVERNANCE STRUCTURE

4.1 Region X, Philippines in the face of Typhoon Washi	58
4.1.1 Non-Government Organizations	60
4.1.2 The role of women in disaster response	63
4.2. The Philippine disaster management network structure: Too good to be true?	66
4.2.1 Governance Structure in the Iligan City DRRM network	67
4.2.2 Governance Structure in the Cagayan De Oro City DRRM network	71
4.2.3 Governance Structure in the Province of Misamis Oriental DRRM network	75
4.2.4 Governance Structure in the Region X DRRM Network	79
4.2.5 DRRM Networks in Region X: Summary	83
4.2.6 Discussion	90
4.2.7 Conclusion	95

CHAPTER V - GOVERNANCE PROCESS.

Covering the cost of the past: Disaster management processes in the most typhoon-affected region in the Philippines

5.1. Introduction	97
5.2 Descriptive Statistics	98
5.3 The Outer Model: Validity and Reliability of the Indicators	100
5.4 The Inner Model: R square, Q2, VIF, and F2	103
5.5 Hypotheses Testing: Regression analysis (PLS-SEM)	105
5.5.1 Previous Performance (Initial Condition)	107
5.5.2 Independent and Dependent Variables	112

5.5.2.1 The significant relationship between previous performance and initial agreement, leadership and managing conflict	112
5.5.2.2 Initial agreement and leadership	114
5.5.2.3 On leadership and trust	115
5.5.2.4 On trust and planning	117
5.5.2.5 On managing conflict and planning	118
5.6 Discussion	119
5.7 Conclusion	123

CHAPTER VI - OUTPUT AND OUTCOME

Existing relationship and Social capital: What have we become after the disasters?

6.1 Introduction	124
6.2 Output: Existing relationship	125
6.3 Outcome: Impacts of disaster governance on social capital	128
6.3.1 Introduction	128
6.3.2 Findings	130
6.3.2.1 Trust and solidarity	132
6.3.2.2 Social Cohesion	130
6.3.2.3 Institutional Analysis	135
6.3.3 Discussion	141
6.3.4 Conclusion	146

CHAPTER VII - SUMMARY, CONCLUSION, IMPLICATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1 Summary of Results	148
------------------------	-----

7.1.1 Structural analysis	148
7.1.2 Disaster Governance processes	151
7.1.3 Output and Outcome of collaborative disaster governance	155
7.2 Conclusions	157
7.3 Implication.	159
7.4 Recommendations	164

References

Curriculum Vitae

Appendices

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1	List of Devastating Typhoons in the Philippines 2010-2015
Table 2.1	DRRM Related - Policies
Table 2.2	Map of related literature on collaborative governance
Table 2.3	Map of related studies on disaster collaborative governance
Table 2.4	The Conceptual and Operational Definition of Terms
Table 2.5	DRRM Council Indicators for Collaborative Effectiveness
Table 3.1	The Distribution of Agencies Involved Per City
Table 3.2	Distribution of the Respondents
Table 3.3	List of Key Informants
Table 3.4	Data Collection
Table 4.1	The topographic metrics of the Iligan DRRM network
Table 4.2	The centralization scores for the Iligan DRRM network
Table 4.3	Centrality scores of the Iligan DRRM Network Members
Table 4.4	The topographic metrics of the Cagayan de Oro network
Table 4.5	The centralization scores of the Cagayan de Oro network
Table 4.6	Centrality scores of the Cagayan de Oro Network
Table 4.7	The topographic metrics of the Misamis Oriental network
Table 4.8	The centralization scores of Misamis Oriental network
Table 4.9	The Centrality Score of Misamis Oriental DRRM Council
Table 4.10	Topographic metrics of the Regional network.
Table 4.11	The centralization scores of the Region 10 network.
Table 4.12	The Centrality Scores in the Region 10 DRRM Council
Table 4.13	Topographic metrics and centrality scores of the networks

- Table 4.14 The summary of the centrality scores of each network
- Table 5.1 Respondent's Profile
- Table 5.2 Reliability Statistics
- Table 5.3 Discriminant validity - Heterotrait-Monotrait Ratio of Correlations
- Table 5.4 Factor Analysis
- Table 5.5 Assessment of the Structural Model
- Table 5.6 Hypotheses Testing: Summary of the Path Analysis
- Table 5.7 Performance Assessment of Disaster Management Networks in Region 10, Philippines
- Table 6.1 Distribution of key informants

LIST OF FIGURES

- Figure 1.1 Tropical Cyclone Frequency in the Philippines, 1990-2013
- Figure 1.2 Structure of Dissertation
- Figure 2.1 The Levels of DRRM Act Implementation
- Figure 2.2 The National DRRM Council
- Figure 2.3 The Local DRRM Council
- Figure 2.4 The Organizational Structure under the NDRP
- Figure 2.5 Cross-sector Collaboration Model by Bryson et al., (2006)
- Figure 2.6. Research Model
- Figure 3.1 The Philippine Map showing the location of the Region X and the focus of this research: Cities of Cagayan de Oro and Iligan, Province of Misamis Oriental
- Figure 4.1 The Iligan City DRRM Network Structure
- Figure 4.2 The Cagayan de Oro City DRRM Network Structure
- Figure 4.3 The Province of Misamis Oriental Network Structure
- Figure 4.4 The Region 10 DRRM Network Structure
- Figure 4.5 The Overall Region 10 DRRM Network Structure
- Figure 5.1 The structural model showing the corresponding p-values
- Figure 6.1 Trust and solidarity based on the goods and services received
- Figure 6.2 Social Network
- Figure 6.3 Institutional analysis
- Figure 7.1 Proposed model for cross-sector collaboration in disaster management

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AFP	Armed Forces of the Philippines
BFP	Bureau of Fire Protection
CAO	City Agriculturist's Office
CENRO	City Environment and Natural Resources Office
CEO	City Engineering Office
CHO	City Health Office
CPDO	City Planning and Development Office
CSO	Civil Society Organization
CSWD	City Social and Welfare Development
CVO	City Veterinary Office
DA	Department of Agriculture
DENR	Department of Environment and Natural Resources
DEPED	Department of Education
DFA	Department of Foreign Affairs
DILG	Department of Interior and Local Government
DOH	Department of Health
DOLE	Department of Labor and Employment
DOST	Department of Science and Technology
DPWH	Department of Public Works and High Ways
DRRM	Disaster Risk Reduction and Management
DRRMC	Disaster Risk Reduction and Management Council
DRRRMO	Disaster Risk Reduction and Management Office
DSWD	Department of Social Welfare and Development

ECOWEB	Ecosystems Work for Essential Benefits
LCE	Local Chief Executive
LGU	Local Government Unit
MSU-IIT	Mindanao State University – Iligan Institute of Technology
NBI	National Bureau of Investigation
NDRP	National Disaster Response Plan
NDRRMC	National Disaster Risk Reduction and Management Council
NGO	Non-governmental Organization
NHA	National Housing Authority
OCD	Office of the Civil Defence
PAGASA	Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration
PAO	Provincial Agriculturists' Office
PCG	Philippine Coast Guard
PEO	Provincial Engineering Office
PHO	Provincial Health Office
PIA	Philippine Information Agency
PNP	Philippine National Police
PPDO	Provincial Planning and Development Office
PRC	Philippine Red Cross
SNA	Social Network Analysis
TESDA	Technical Education and Skills Development Authority
XU	Xavier University

LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix A. Research tool on Collaborative Governance

Appendix B. Research tool on Social Capital

Appendix C. Interview Guide