

## Chapter Four

### Finding and Discussion

In this section, the researcher presents and explains the findings from the interview which have been gathered and analyzed. The researcher also related the findings with the theory from the literature review.

#### **Finding**

There are four main topics that explained in details. The first topic answers the first research question dealing with the students' perception towards their writing skill. The second finding answers the second question dealing with the students' perception towards their teacher feedback in writing skill. And the third finding answers the last research question about the benefits of teacher feedback according to the students' point of view. The last findings reveal other data dealing with the implementation of teacher feedback that do not directly relate to the research questions, yet they are worthy to be discussed at hand.

**How students perceive their writing skill.** The researcher has asked all of the participants dealing with how they perceive their writing skill during their study at English Education Department of Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta. There are three findings from this topic.

***Finding 1: Students' writing skill is intermediate.*** Based on the interview, there are three participants who said that their writing skill is intermediate or moderate.

Participant A said that her skill is at an intermediate level compared to the one when she was still in the first year of her study at English Education Department of Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta. The second participant is participant B who said that her skill is moderate because she got A in writing classes. The last is participant E who said that her writing skill is moderate.

“My writing skill is intermediate, I mean I am not a beginner, but I am not an advance either. First, it is because my writing score is improving, so far so good. Maybe I was a beginner, but now my writing score is improving. Second, I feel like I can write easily now.” (Participant A, 2015)

“In my opinion, my writing skill is not too bad, but not perfect either, so just moderate.” (Participant E, 2015)

***Finding 2: Students' writing skill is improved.*** There are also participants who feel that their writing skill is improved during their study in collage. Participant C and participant D said that their writing skill is improved during their study at English Education Department of Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta.

“My writing skill during my study at English Education Department of Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta from the first semester until the eighth semester is improving.” (Participant C, 2015)

“In my opinion, my writing skill tends to improve; I remember that my writing was so absurd when I was in the first semester.” (Participant D, 2015)

***Finding 3: Students' writing skill is good.*** The last finding from the interview that has been analyzed is that participant F's writing skill is good.

“Oh, I think my writing skill is good.” (Participant F, 2015)

Based on the findings above, the researcher concluded that the participants' writing skill is in an intermediate level. Moreover, there is also improvement in the participants writing skill. It means that their perception is all positive.

**How students perceive their teacher feedback in writing skill.** The next data are dealing with the participants' perception towards teacher feedback in their writing. There are seven topics regarded to teacher feedback in this part. The first is about the focus of the feedback given by the teacher. The next is the types of the teacher feedback that are usually used by the teacher. And then there are forms of teacher feedback usually given by teacher in participants' writing. The next is the effective teacher feedback and the role of teacher feedback from participants' perspective. The last is about participants' favorite teacher feedback and how the participants' feeling after they got teacher feedback.

***Finding 1: The focuses of teacher feedback.*** The data from the interview show that teacher feedback usually focuses on the content of the writing, grammatical, and writing structure. These are the perception of participant A and participant F.

“Usually, teacher gives feedback about the grammatical or content of the writing.” (Participant A, 2015)

Moreover, there are also the other focuses of teacher feedback like writing concept, wording and meaning of word, APA (American Psychological

Association) style, the connection of the sentence and paragraph, and the topic and main sentence. These are based on participant D and also participant F.

“...when I submit my thesis, teacher will criticize not only the content, but also the grammar, wording, meaning of word, meaning of sentence, and APA (American Psychological Association) style.” (Participant F, 2015)

It can be summarize that there are eight focuses of teacher feedback according to the participants. The focuses are on the content of the writing, grammatical, writing structure, writing concept, wording and meaning of word, APA (American Psychological Association) style, the connection of the sentence and paragraph, and the topic and main sentence.

***Finding 2: The types of teacher feedback.*** The next data are dealing with the types of the teacher feedback. Four of the participants mentioned written feedback. Yet the three of them added another types. Participant C also mentioned oral feedback, participant E mentioned oral consultation, and participant F mentioned oral feedback and new knowledge. Then participant D mentioned direct feedback.

“It is usually written feedback for writing class.” (Participant A, 2015)

“Feedback from the teacher is usually direct on the task.” (Participant D, 2015)

“...teacher gives a chance for the students to ask about the feedback, so it is like oral consultation.” (Participant E, 2015)

“It is written feedback and oral feedback. Nah, next, other than feedback, I am usually given new knowledge.” (Participant F, 2015)

The findings above show that there are five types of teacher feedback based on the participants' point of view. There are written feedback, oral consultation, oral feedback, new knowledge, and direct feedback.

***Finding 3: The forms of teacher feedback.*** As for the forms of teacher feedback, the participants have mentioned many of them. There is a participant who mentioned one forms, yet there are also three participants who mentioned at least three forms.

There is sign with and without that has been mentioned by participant A, participant B, participant C and participant D. Then, there is comment which was mentioned by three participants. They are participant A, participant E, and participant F.

“...for example, I make a sentence or writing, and there are errors. So the teachers sign it then give the correction.” (Participant C, 2015)

“...my paper was returned with a lot of comment on it.” (Participant A, 2015)

The other forms of teacher feedback that was mentioned by two participants are critic and question. Both participant E and participant F have mentioned it in the interview. Additionally, participant E added a compliment as a form of teacher feedback.

“For example, if the feedback comes from my teacher, it will be like “what do you mean by this?” (Participant F, 2015)

“Sometimes teacher writes like comment, critic, and compliment.” (Participant E, 2015)

Next, participant B mentioned another two forms of teacher feedback that did not mentioned by the other participants. They are symbol or emoticon, and sentence. The last form of teacher feedback comes from participant C who mentioned score in the interview.

“During my study, I just got sentence as the feedback. Then there is symbols sometimes, it is like smile emoticon.” (Participant B, 2015)

“....maybe it is like score.” (Participant C, 2015)

In short, the data above show that there are eight forms of teacher feedback. The forms are sign, comment, question, critic, compliment, symbols or emoticon, sentence and score.

***Finding 4: The effective teacher feedback.*** The researcher also sought the participants’ perception towards the most effective teacher feedback. According to the data from the participant B’s interview, there are two effective types or forms of teacher feedback sentence with explanation, and explicit correction. Participant C also mentioned correction feedback. Then, participant E mentioned the last three effective types or forms of teacher feedback.

“The effective feedback of course it is a sentence with the explanation.”  
(Participant B, 2015)

“Of course it is positive feedback. But the one that i often look at is comment. Even if i get many comments, or questions, i will think that my writing is not good yet.” (Participant E, 2015)

To sum up, there are five of effective teacher feedbacks according to the participants. They are sentence with explanation, correction feedback, positive feedback, comments, and questions.

***Finding 5: The roles of teacher feedback.*** The next data that have been gathered is dealing with the role of teacher feedback from participants' perspective. The roles of teacher feedback based on participant B are to improve skill and writing skill. Then, participant D said that teacher feedback is really important. It is in line with participant F's perception, she said that teacher feedback is a good thing and it really helps.

“I think it improves our skill, as I know, feedback is aimed to make our writing better.” (Participant B, 2015)

“It is really important. It can help me to write better in the future.”  
(Participant D, 2015)

“I think feedback is a good thing and it really helps students to improve writing.” (Participant F, 2015)

There are five roles of teacher feedback that have mentioned by the participant. They mentioned that the roles of teacher feedback are to improve skill and to improve students' writing. It is also really important and good thing, and then it really helps

***Finding 6: Favorite teacher feedback.*** The next data are dealing with students' favorite teacher feedback. Participants have different opinion for favorite teacher feedback. Two participants mentioned two types of teacher

feedback that they like. While the other participants mentioned only one type of teacher feedback that they like.

There are three participants who like oral feedback. Moreover, there is only one participant who likes written feedback. The other teacher feedback that has been mentioned is direct feedback. Then participant D said that he likes all kind of feedback. And the last participant likes positive feedback.

“I prefer oral feedback rather than the other feedback.” (Participant C, 2015)

“I do not have specific kind of favorite teacher feedback; I like all kind of feedback.” (Participant D, 2015)

“Of course I like positive feedback.” (Participant F, 2015)

It can be concluded that participants’ favorite teacher feedback is different from one to another. They have different taste of teacher feedback that they would like to obtain.

***Finding 7: Students’ feeling after they got teacher feedback.*** The last finding in this part is dealing with the participants’ feeling after they obtained teacher feedback in their writing. There are two of the participants that feel the importance of teacher feedback. There are also two participants that are completely happy because of teacher feedback. Then, there are two participants that feel frustrated yet happy because of teacher feedback.

“I feel down at first, but slowly I realize the importance of it.” (Participant B, 2015)



“I have mix feeling about it like feeling down, sad, frustrated yet happy.

But, the main feeling is frustrated.” (Participant C, 2015)

“I feel so happy because of teacher feedback.” (Participant D, 2015)

To summarize, the participants’ feeling towards teacher feedback that they got is various. They feel some kinds of feeling because of teacher feedback.

### **How students perceive the benefits of teacher feedback in writing skill.**

The other questions of the interview sought the participants’ perception towards the benefits of teacher feedback in writing skill. Participants have mentioned different benefits of teacher feedback in their writing as what they feel about it. There are twelve findings in this topic which are explained as following.

***Finding 1: Teacher feedback improves students’ writing skill.*** There is a benefit that mentioned by five participants. They said that teacher feedback improves writing skill. They agreed that their writing skill is improved because of teacher feedback that they got.

“It is good. I can improve my writing skill through teacher feedback.”

(Participant B, 2015)

“....maybe it is because I got teacher feedback in my writing from my teacher.” (Participant A, 2015)

***Finding 2: teacher feedback points out students’ weakness, error and difficulty.*** The next finding is mentioned by three participants. They admitted that they know their difficulty in writing after they obtained teacher feedback.

“I know my weakness and my difficulty because of teacher feedback.”

(Participant B, 2015)

“I know my weakness and the error of my writing through teacher feedback.” (Participant C, 2015)

***Finding 3: Students learn from mistakes because of teacher feedback.***

The second benefit was mentioned by three participants. The participants said that they can learn from mistakes because of teacher feedback. They admitted that they learn to write better because they obtained teacher feedback.

“My teacher gives feedback in my writing. So that I know what is wrong with my writing, and it is really useful. And from teacher feedback, I can learn from my mistakes.” (Participant C, 2015)

***Finding 4: Students understand the error because of teacher feedback.***

The next benefit of teacher feedback is mentioned by two participants. They said that they can understand the error of their writing if they got teacher feedback.

“Teacher feedback allows me to understand my error in my writing.”  
(Participant E, 2015)

***Finding 5: Teacher feedback points out aspects to improve.*** The next finding from the interview is that teacher feedback points out the aspects that need to be improved by students. It was mentioned by two participants.

“I know what I need to improve in my writing because of teacher feedback.” (Participant F, 2015)

***Finding 6: Teacher feedback improves grammatical skill.*** Another benefit of teacher feedback that mentioned by two participants is that teacher feedback improves grammatical skill. Participant D and participant F admitted that their grammatical skill improves because teacher feedback.

“I feel that my grammatical skill is improving because the teacher feedback that I got.” (Participant D, 2015)

***Finding 7: Teacher feedback improves writing concept.*** Participant D mentioned another benefit of teacher feedback that did not mentioned by other participants. He said that it helps his writing concept to be better.

“....and my writing concept improves after I got teacher feedback, I know how to make main idea and topic sentence, and where I should put it.”  
(Participant D, 2015)

***Finding 8: Teacher feedback improves students' confidence.*** Participant A also mentioned another benefit of teacher feedback. She said that teacher feedback improves students' confidence.

“....after I got feedback, I will revise my writing. Then, when I re-submit my writing, I feel more confident.” (Participant A, 2015)

***Finding 9: Teacher feedback improves critical and analytical thinking.*** This is another benefit of teacher feedback that mentioned only by one participant. Participant F said that her critical and analytical thinking improved because of teacher feedback.

“....then, it improves my critical and analytical thinking. For example, now I do not just write, but I relate my writing with others' writing.”  
(Participant F, 2015)

***Finding 10: Teacher feedback helps students avoid the same mistakes.*** Participant E mentioned another different benefit of teacher feedback. She said that teacher feedback helps students to avoid the same mistakes.

“....so it will help students to avoid the same mistakes in the future.”

(Participant E, 2015)

***Finding 11: Students aware to use conjunction because of teacher feedback.*** The other benefit of teacher feedback was mentioned by participant B. She said that she realize that conjunction is important to be used because of teacher feedback.

“....finally I realize to use conjunction in my writing because of teacher feedback.” (Participant B, 2015)

***Finding 12: Teacher feedback gives new information.*** The last benefit comes from participant C. He said that teacher feedback gives new knowledge or information for the students.

“I got new knowledge that I did not know when I wrote my writing. so that I know something new because of teacher feedback.” (Participant C, 2015)

In short, there are a lot of benefits of teacher feedback which the researcher could compile through the interview. They are. In other words, all participants took the benefits of the teacher feedbacks that were given by the teachers in their writing.

**How students implement teacher feedback in their writing skill.** In this part, the researcher presents the last finding which is dealing with participants' routine after they got teacher feedback in their writing. Most of the participants directly revise their writing based on the teacher feedback. But there are also other routines that the participants do before and after revise their writing.

Firstly, participant A admitted that she usually directly revise her writing based on the teacher feedback. Then she will also apply it in her next writing to avoid the same mistakes. After she revised their writing, she usually re-read her writing along with the feedback, thus she knew that her writing is better after she got teacher feedback.

“I usually revise my writing directly based on the feedback. Then I apply the feedback for my other writings. I usually re-read my writing, and I found it better than before after I got feedback.” (Participant A, 2015)

Secondly, participant B said that she would re-read her writing along with the teacher feedback. And then she would make sure to the teacher about the feedback before finally she started to revise her writing. She added that she usually saved the feedback to be able to learn it another time.

“First, I re-read my writing, and then I keep the paper so that I can study it again later. If there is something I do not understand, I will ask the teacher. After that I revise my writing.” (Participant B, 2015)

The next participant C has unique routine before revising his writing. Participant C said he usually meditates, finds new theory and re-reads the past subject before starting to revise his writing. He meditated because he felt confused and frustrated after obtaining the teacher feedback.

“At first I will meditate, and then I find the theory that relate to the feedback, and re-read past subject. After that I will revise my writing.” (Participant C, 2015)

Then, participant D usually memorizes the feedback before applying it to his writing and after that he would notice his mistakes in order to avoid the same mistakes in the future.

“Of course I will remember the feedback, so that I will not make the same mistake. Then the right one will be applied in my writing. Last, I will notice the mistakes.” (Participant D, 2015)

Next, the other participant who directly revises her writing is participant E. Moreover, she said that she will also re-read the past subject while revising her writing.

“For sure I will directly revise my writing based on the feedback while I re-read the past subject.” (Participant E, 2015)

The last participant has different routines other than revising their writing. Participant F said that she will analyze teacher’s aim through his/her feedback before starting to dig her mistakes. The next is she will revise her writing and re-read it afterward. The last routine of participant F was to ask her friend to proofread her writing.

“First, I will not directly revise my writing based on the feedback, but I try to analyze teacher's aim, then I try to dig my mistakes. After that I will start to revise my writing, and then I read it and revise it again. The last, I will ask my friend to proofread and then I revise it again.” (Participant F, 2015)

In conclusion, all the participants have routine to revise their writing because of teacher feedback. They do not ignore or underestimate their teacher’s

feedback because they took the benefits of the teacher feedback for betterment of their writing.

## **Discussion**

Based on the findings above, this research revealed four main topics dealing with teacher feedback in writing skill. This part presents the connection of the findings with the theory that has been mentioned before in chapter two. Those four main topics are explained below.

**How students perceive their writing skill.** Some students at English Education Department of Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta consider their writing skill is in intermediate level. While the other students consider that their writing skill is improved. There are some factors that influence students writing skill. One of the factors is teacher feedback. Brookhart (2008 as cited in Elshirbini, 2013) indicated feedback as the other factor that may influence students' writing skill "with the absence of feedback, students can become demotivated" (p. 5). Moreover, the implementation of the teacher feedback that students usually do after they got it is also essential. Chandler's research (as cited in Hyland, 2006) indicated that the accuracy of students' writing improved significantly over a semester when they corrected their errors after feedback compared to when they did not. It also happens at English Education Department of Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta since the finding above revealed that students usually revise their writing based on the teacher feedback they got.

**How students perceive their teacher feedback in writing skill.** Students have mentioned their perception about teacher feedback that they got in their

writing. They got teacher feedback as what Mottet (2008) has defined it, teacher feedback is information from a source to a recipient dealing with the correctness, accuracy, or appropriateness of the recipients' past performance (as cited in Maarof, 2011). It is also appropriate with the definition from Mack (2009), "any comment, questions or error correction that is written on students' assignments" (p.34). It means that teacher usually corrects students' writing or just simply gives like signs in students' writing if there is an error. Therefore, the finding above revealed that teacher at English Education Department of Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta often gives feedback in students' writing.

Furthermore, the forms of teacher feedback usually given by teacher are signs with and without explanation, correction, comment, questions, critic, compliment, symbol or emoticon, and score. It is appropriate with what have been mentioned by some theorists like Lee and Silver (2007) who said that teacher feedback is presented into three forms including praise, advice and critic. The other forms that mentioned by the participants like question, comment and compliment can be included into Straub (1997, as cited in Hamp-Lyons & Chen (n.d)) and Hamp-Lyon and Chen's classification.

Besides that, it can be concluded that this finding also is appropriate with Ellis's (2009) theory dealing with type of teacher feedback. Ellis (2009) divided teacher feedback into two types like direct and indirect feedback. Direct feedback is when teacher give explicit correction, while indirect feedback is when teacher uses underline, circle, and others to pointing out the errors. Based on the data



above, teachers at English Education Department of Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta usually give correction or sign and symbol in students' writing.

The next finding shows that teacher feedback given to the students is mostly focuses on the content, grammatical, writing structure, writing concept, wording and meaning of word, APA (American Psychological Association) style, the connection of the sentence and paragraph, and the topic and main sentence. Based on those focuses, it can be summarized that teachers at English Education Department of Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta usually give all the three types of teacher feedback according to Park (2006). These three types are form-focused feedback where teachers only focus on the surface errors and grammar without give the correction; content-based feedback which deals with the content and the concept of the writing; and the last is integrative feedback which is the combination of form-focused feedback and content-based feedback.

According to the participants, teacher at English Education Department of Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta gives both oral and written feedback in their writing, but the participants have their own favorite feedback. It is known that oral feedback is the most favorite feedback among the students. This finding disagrees with the research from Diab (2005) and Arndt (1993), Saito (1994), and F. Hyland (2001a) that revealed many students choose comments on the writing style and ideas/content as the most important teacher feedback they look at and they are positive about receiving indirect feedback on errors, giving them clues rather than corrections (as cited in Hyland, K & Hyland, F, 2006). Nevertheless,

students still give good responses if teacher gives written feedback because they believe that it can help them to write better.

Previous researches dealing with students' perception towards teacher feedback indicated that students are frustrated if there is no teacher feedback. As Leki (1991), Ferris and Roberts (2001) (as cited in Srichanyachon, 2012, p. 9) said that students tend to expect the teacher to comment on their written errors and are frustrated if this does not happen. The finding revealed that some of the students are frustrated after they got teacher feedback. Yet there are also students who feel happy with the existence of teacher feedback.

The last but not least, students believe that the role of teacher feedback has really big effect towards the improvement of their writing. Hyland, K and Hyland, F (2006) have said that teacher written response play a central role in most of second and foreign language writing classes. It is proved by the students feeling and belief towards teacher feedback. And then, the fact that students consider teacher feedback as an important and good thing in writing skill is appropriate with Maroof's (2011) opinion that students considered teacher feedback as an important and necessary aspect in responding to their essay writing.

#### **How students perceive the benefits of teacher feedback in writing skill.**

The findings of this study indicate many benefits of teacher feedback that can help teachers in improving students' writing skill. The participants have mentioned the benefits of teacher feedback that they gained after they got teacher feedback in their writing. It agrees with Hepplestone, Holden, Irwin, Parkin and Horpe (2011); Randall and Zundel (2012) who said that feedback identified students' strengths,

weaknesses and areas for improvement in a structured and cohesive way; and then use these to set future learning targets.

The other benefits mentioned by the participants are that students know and notice their error, and are aware to use conjunction because of teacher feedback. This finding is appropriate with Garcia's point of view stating that "teacher feedback can help students become aware of errors and other writing problems" (1999 as cited in Jing, 2010, p.1) Students admitted that after they got teacher feedback, they can avoid the same mistakes in the future.

The next benefit of teacher feedback comes from Hyland, K and Hyland, F (2006) who said that "feedback is a key element of the scaffolding provided by the teacher to build learners' confidence and the literacy resources to participate in the target community"(p. 83). The finding has revealed that students' confidence improve because of teacher feedback.